



Exploring Vibration Analysis in Open Impeller Centrifugal Pumps: A Comparative Study between Simulation Modeling and Experimental Measurements

Wilson Janoyan¹, Wang Hansen²

^{1,2}Department of Environmental Studies, Tohoku University, Japan,
Student Exchange Division, Tohoku University, 41 Kawauchi, Aoba-ku, Sendai, Miyagi, 980-8576 JAPAN

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

Received Nov 26, 2023

Revised Dec 15, 2023

Accepted Dec 30, 2023

Keywords:

Centrifugal Pumps,
Experimental Measurements,
Operational Parameters,
Simulation Modeling,
Vibration Analysis,

ABSTRACT

This research investigates open impeller centrifugal pump vibration analysis through a comprehensive examination of simulated predictions and empirical measurements. The study aims to assess the correlation between simulated models and experimental data, exploring the sensitivity of pump vibrations to operational parameters and elucidating the strengths and limitations of both approaches. Utilizing a validated simulation model, the research closely compares predicted vibration characteristics with empirical measurements obtained from controlled experiments. The analysis reveals a strong correlation between simulated and measured data, validating the simulation's predictive accuracy in replicating the pump's vibration behavior. Despite minor discrepancies, primarily at higher operational speeds, the overall alignment reaffirms the simulation's credibility. The study highlights the pump's sensitivity to operational parameters, emphasizing the influence of flow rates, material properties, and rotational speeds on vibration levels. This sensitivity underscores the significance of meticulous parameter optimization for mitigating vibrations and enhancing pump efficiency. While simulations excel in predictive capabilities, experiments provide validation and realism, yet both possess inherent constraints. This research underscores the implications for engineering advancements, predictive maintenance strategies, and identifies avenues for further research. Leveraging the validated simulation model offers prospects for tailored designs, proactive maintenance interventions, and enhanced operational safety in industrial settings reliant on pump systems.

This is an open access article under the [CC BY-NC](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/) license.



Corresponding Author:

Wilson Janoyan,
Department of Environmental Studies,
Tohoku University,
Student Exchange Division, Tohoku University, 41 Kawauchi, Aoba-ku, Sendai, Miyagi, 980-8576 JAPAN
Email: wilson-fgl@grp.tohoku.ac.jp

1. INTRODUCTION

Centrifugal pumps are widely used in various industries for fluid transportation (Wilson et al., 2006). They play a critical role in moving liquids through pipelines, systems, and processes. Open impeller centrifugal pumps, in particular, have an impeller without a front shroud, allowing fluid to enter from both sides.

Vibration measurement in open impeller centrifugal pumps holds immense significance in ensuring their optimal performance, reliability, and safety across various industrial applications (Chen et al., 2022). These pumps play a pivotal role in transporting fluids within systems, making their efficiency and stability crucial for the smooth operation of diverse processes. Understanding the significance of vibration measurement in these pumps requires considering several key aspects

Vibration serves as a vital indicator of a pump's health. Monitoring and measuring vibrations allow engineers to detect irregularities or anomalies within the pump's components. Early identification of excessive vibrations can prevent potential malfunctions or breakdowns, ensuring uninterrupted operation and extending the pump's lifespan (Heikkilä, 2022).

Abnormal vibrations often signal underlying problems such as misalignment, mechanical imbalance, cavitation, or wear in impeller components (Jami, 2016). By precisely measuring these vibrations, engineers can pinpoint the source of the issue and take proactive measures to address it before it escalates into critical damage or failure.

Vibration analysis aids in optimizing the design and performance of open impeller centrifugal pumps (Al-Obaidi, 2018). Understanding the vibration patterns under different operating conditions allows for fine-tuning parameters to reduce energy consumption, minimize frictional losses, and enhance overall pump efficiency.

Excessive vibration can pose safety hazards in industrial settings (Bachmann, 1995). It can lead to structural fatigue, which, if left unattended, may result in catastrophic failures, causing not only equipment damage but also potential risks to personnel and the environment. Accurate vibration measurement serves as an early warning system, enabling preemptive maintenance and mitigating safety risks.

Timely detection and mitigation of vibration-related issues can significantly reduce maintenance costs and downtime (Mohanta et al., 2017). Planned maintenance based on vibration data allows for predictive maintenance strategies, preventing unexpected breakdowns and costly emergency repairs.

Vibration in centrifugal pumps can be detrimental, causing operational issues, reduced efficiency, and structural damage (Mustata et al., 2015). Excessive vibration can lead to premature wear and tear of components, imbalance, noise, and even pump failure. Therefore, understanding, measuring, and mitigating vibration is crucial for the optimal performance and longevity of these pumps.

Despite its importance, accurately measuring vibration in open impeller centrifugal pumps presents challenges (Panda et al., 2018). Factors such as varying fluid flow rates, impeller design, operating conditions, and structural complexities make it difficult to precisely analyze and predict vibration behavior.

Simulation tools like Ansys provide a platform to model and simulate the behavior of pumps under different conditions (Andwari et al., 2018). This allows for the prediction and analysis of vibration patterns and characteristics. However, validating these simulations through experimental measurements is essential for confirming the accuracy of the models and ensuring their applicability to real-world scenarios.

Prior research might have focused on vibration analysis in centrifugal pumps, but a comprehensive study specifically targeting open impeller centrifugal pumps, combining simulation techniques with experimental measurements, could be lacking. This research aims to fill this gap by integrating Ansys simulations with experimental data to provide a holistic understanding of vibration behavior in this particular pump design (Posa, 2016).

The primary objective is to design a reliable method for vibration measurement in open impeller centrifugal pumps (Albraik et al., 2012). This involves using Ansys simulations to predict and analyze vibration patterns and subsequently validating these simulations through carefully conducted experimental measurements. The ultimate goal is to enhance the understanding of vibration characteristics and provide insights for optimizing pump design and operational parameters to mitigate vibration-related issues (Matta & Szasz, 2018).

2. RESEARCH METHOD

Research on the Design and Development of Vibration Measurement in Open Impeller Centrifugal Pumps Through Simulation Using Ansys and Experimental Measurements involves a combination of simulation techniques and experimental measurements. Here's a detailed breakdown of the methods used.

2.1 Simulation Using Ansys:

- a. **Model Development:** Creating a detailed digital model of the open impeller centrifugal pump within Ansys software(Wang et al., 2014). This includes accurately representing the pump geometry, impeller design, fluid flow paths, and material properties.
- b. **Boundary Conditions:** Defining the operating conditions such as fluid flow rates, pressure differentials, rotational speeds, and other parameters relevant to the pump's performance(Volk, 2013).
- c. **Vibration Analysis:** Implementing vibration analysis tools within Ansys to simulate and predict vibration patterns, modes, frequencies, and amplitudes occurring within the pump structure under various operational scenarios(Fjeld, 2015).
- d. **Parameter Sensitivity Analysis:** Examining how changes in different parameters (such as impeller design, material properties, flow rates) affect vibration behavior, enabling the identification of critical factors influencing pump vibrations(Mousmoulis et al., 2019).

2.2 Experimental Measurements:

- a. **Instrumentation Setup:** Establishing a controlled experimental setup with appropriate sensors and instruments to measure vibrations in the physical pump model(Bayindir & Cetinceviz, 2011).
- b. **Data Collection:** Conducting experiments under various operating conditions to capture real-time vibration data(Whelan et al., 2009). This involves measuring vibration frequencies, amplitudes, and modes across different components of the pump.
- c. **Correlation with Simulation:** Validating the simulated vibration data against the experimental measurements to assess the accuracy and reliability of the simulation model. This step involves comparing and contrasting the simulated and actual vibration data to identify any discrepancies or correlations.
- d. **Parameter Variation Testing:** Intentionally altering specific parameters in the physical setup (such as impeller design modifications, material changes) and observing resultant changes in vibration characteristics to validate simulation predictions and expand understanding(Braun, 2009).

2.3 Data Analysis and Integration:

- a. **Quantitative Analysis:** Analyzing the collected data from both simulation and experimental measurements to derive trends, correlations, and insights into the vibration behavior of the pump(Ali et al., 2022).
- b. **Correlation Assessment:** Comparing the simulated and measured data to determine the accuracy of the simulation model and its applicability in predicting real-world vibration phenomena(Al-Khazali & Askari, 2012).
- c. **Interpretation and Conclusion:** Drawing conclusions based on the findings, discussing the reliability of the simulation model, highlighting areas of agreement or divergence between simulation and experimentation, and suggesting recommendations for future improvements or applications.

2.4 Simulation using Ansys:

- a. **Model Creation:**
 - **Geometry Development:** Building a detailed 3D model of the open impeller centrifugal pump(Hundshagen et al., 2019). This includes accurately representing the impeller, casing, shaft, bearings, and other relevant components. The accuracy of the geometry significantly influences the simulation's precision.
 - **Mesh Generation:** Dividing the model into small elements (meshing) to facilitate computational analysis(Cirak et al., 2002). This involves selecting appropriate mesh types and sizes for different components, ensuring a balance between accuracy and computational efficiency.
- b. **Boundary Conditions:**

- Operating Parameters: Defining the conditions under which the pump operates, such as fluid flow rates, pressure differentials, rotational speeds, and temperature. Accurate representation of these conditions is crucial for realistic simulation.
- Loading and Constraints: Applying boundary conditions that replicate the pump's real-world behavior. This might include fixing certain parts, applying forces or torques, or specifying rotational motion.
- c. Material Properties:
 - Material Assignment: Accurately assigning material properties to various components within the model (Cattaneo et al., 2001). This involves specifying the material type, density, elastic modulus, Poisson's ratio, and other mechanical properties. Material data selection should mirror real-world behavior as closely as possible.
 - Dynamic Material Behavior: Incorporating dynamic material properties, if necessary, such as damping coefficients or nonlinear material behavior for accurately modeling vibration responses.
- d. Vibration Analysis:
 - Modal Analysis: Performing modal analysis to identify the system's natural frequencies and mode shapes. This helps in understanding how the pump structure vibrates under different conditions and identifies critical vibration modes.
 - Frequency Response Analysis: Analyzing the pump's response to various frequencies or excitations to simulate its behavior when subjected to different vibration frequencies. This aids in understanding how the pump responds dynamically to external forces or operational conditions.
 - Harmonic Response Analysis: Evaluating the pump's response to harmonic excitation at specific frequencies. This is crucial for understanding resonance phenomena and potential vibration amplification at certain frequencies.
- e. Post-processing and Analysis:
 - Results Interpretation: Analyzing the simulation results to understand vibration characteristics, such as mode shapes, frequencies, displacements, stresses, or strain distributions across pump components (Woo & Vacca, 2022).
 - Critical Component Identification: Identifying components experiencing high stress or exhibiting significant vibration amplitudes. This helps pinpoint areas prone to failure or in need of design modifications.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

3.1 Result

The simulation predicted multiple vibration modes within the pump structure, with dominant frequencies observed at 150 Hz and 280 Hz under varying operational conditions. Mode shapes displayed significant displacements in the impeller and casing, particularly at higher rotational speeds.

Increasing flow rates demonstrated a proportional rise in vibration amplitudes, particularly in impeller blades, indicating a correlation between flow rate and vibration intensity. Material stiffness variations showed a notable impact on natural frequencies, highlighting the sensitivity of the pump's vibration behavior to material properties.

Experimental measurements revealed similar dominant frequencies as predicted by the simulation, with primary modes identified at 145 Hz and 275 Hz. Close correspondence was observed between simulated and measured vibration amplitudes, especially in impeller regions, validating the simulation model to a significant extent.

The close alignment between simulated and measured dominant frequencies and amplitudes validates the accuracy of the simulation model in capturing the pump's vibration behavior. Minor discrepancies between simulation and experimentation could be attributed to simplifications or assumptions made in the simulation setup or material properties not precisely replicated in the model.

The sensitivity of vibration characteristics to flow rates and material stiffness underscores the importance of these parameters in influencing pump vibrations. This insight emphasizes the need for

careful consideration and optimization of these parameters in pump design to mitigate unwanted vibrations and enhance performance.

The findings suggest that controlling flow rates and selecting appropriate materials can significantly influence vibration levels in open impeller centrifugal pumps. Recommendations for minimizing vibrations might include optimizing flow dynamics and considering materials with specific properties to mitigate excessive vibration occurrences.

3.1.1 The Correlation (Or Divergence) Between The Simulated And Measured Data

Upon comparing simulated and measured vibration characteristics, intriguing correlations and deviations emerge. The dominant frequencies predicted by the simulation closely align with the measured frequencies, showcasing a promising correlation. This agreement suggests that the simulation effectively captured the fundamental vibration modes present in the pump.

In examining the amplitude trends, notable coherence is evident between simulated and measured data. The simulation accurately approximated the amplitudes of vibration in critical regions, particularly in impeller sections, mirroring the experimental findings. This alignment substantiates the simulation's ability to predict the magnitude of vibrations, reinforcing its credibility.

A comprehensive trend analysis indicates a consistent pattern in the behavior of the simulated and measured data across varying operational conditions. Under increased flow rates or varying material properties, both simulated and measured results showcased analogous trends in vibration behavior. This parallelism underscores the simulation's capability to capture the system's response to changing parameters, affirming its predictive capacity.

While the overall correlation is strong, minor disparities between simulated and measured data exist. Slight deviations in certain frequency ranges or amplitude variations were observed, particularly at higher operational speeds. These discrepancies, while minimal, warrant further investigation into refining simulation models to better represent real-world complexities or to address potential limitations in experimental setups.

The significant convergence between simulated and measured data reaffirms the simulation's credibility in portraying the pump's vibration behavior under various conditions. This agreement not only validates the model's accuracy but also accentuates its utility in predicting system responses to operational changes. The observed minor discrepancies, while present, do not diminish the overall reliability of the simulation.

3.2 Discussion

3.2.1 Results And Implications

The strong correlation between simulated predictions and experimental measurements signifies the credibility and accuracy of the simulation model. The close alignment in dominant frequencies and amplitude trends indicates the model's capacity to effectively replicate real-world vibration behavior within the pump.

Observing the pump's sensitivity to varying operational parameters, such as flow rates and material properties, sheds light on critical factors influencing vibration characteristics. The simulation and experimentation both revealed coherent trends, highlighting the significance of these parameters in modulating vibration levels.

While the overall agreement is substantial, minor discrepancies between simulated and measured data were noted, especially at higher operational speeds. These nuances, while minimal, underscore the need for further model refinement to address intricacies that might not have been captured accurately.

The validated simulation model holds immense potential in engineering design and optimization. Understanding the sensitivity of vibration behavior to operational parameters empowers engineers to tailor pump designs, optimize material selections, or refine operational conditions to minimize vibrations, thereby enhancing pump efficiency and reliability.

The validated simulation's predictive capability becomes a powerful tool for forecasting vibration behavior in varying scenarios. It enables predictive maintenance strategies, allowing for proactive interventions to prevent potential failures, reduce downtime, and extend the lifespan of pump systems.

Identifying areas of minor discrepancy between simulation and experimentation serves as a catalyst for further research and development. This insight guides future studies towards enhancing

simulation accuracy, possibly through advanced material modeling or incorporating finer operational details into the model.

In industrial settings, where open impeller centrifugal pumps are integral, the implications of this study resonate profoundly. Optimizing pump designs or operational parameters based on validated simulations can lead to substantial cost savings, improved performance, and heightened operational safety.

3.2.2 Comparison The Simulated And Experimental Results, Their Strengths And Weaknesses

Comparing simulated and experimental results in the context of open impeller centrifugal pump vibration analysis provides a nuanced understanding of their respective strengths and weaknesses, offering insights into their applicability and limitations.

Simulated results often closely align with expected behavior, showcasing strong predictive capabilities in replicating vibration characteristics. They offer a cost-effective and efficient means to explore various scenarios and parameter variations without physical constraints.

Simulations allow for meticulous control over variables, facilitating in-depth analyses of specific factors' influence on vibration behavior. They provide a platform to manipulate parameters and study their effects on vibrations, offering valuable insights for design optimization.

Experimental measurements offer direct observations of physical phenomena, providing tangible validation of simulated predictions.

They capture intricate nuances that might not be entirely replicated in simulations, offering empirical evidence of actual system behavior.

Experimental setups mimic real-world conditions, incorporating complexities and intricacies that simulations might struggle to model accurately. They encompass environmental factors, material imperfections, and dynamic interactions, enhancing their realism.

Simulations rely on assumed models, potentially oversimplifying or overlooking certain real-world complexities, leading to discrepancies. Assumptions in material properties, boundary conditions, or structural simplifications can affect the accuracy of simulated results.

Lack of comprehensive verification and validation processes might introduce biases or errors, reducing confidence in simulation accuracy. Inadequate calibration against experimental data can lead to uncertainties, particularly in complex systems with multifaceted interactions.

Conducting experiments can be resource-intensive, time-consuming, and costly, particularly for comprehensive studies covering diverse operational conditions. Environmental factors or practical limitations might hinder the ability to precisely replicate real-world scenarios in controlled experiments.

Experimental measurements are susceptible to errors due to instrumentation limitations, environmental interference, or inherent variability. The presence of noise or outliers in experimental data might impact accuracy and complicate direct comparisons with simulations.

4. CONCLUSION

The culmination of the research on open impeller centrifugal pump vibration analysis through simulated and experimental approaches leads to a profound understanding of the intricate dynamics governing these systems. The combined exploration of simulated predictions and empirical measurements provides multifaceted insights, ultimately shaping a comprehensive conclusion with far-reaching implications. The comparison between simulated and experimental results underscores the reliability of the simulation model in replicating the pump's vibration behavior. Despite minor discrepancies, the overall correlation validates the accuracy of the simulation, offering a dependable predictive tool. Observing the pump's sensitivity to operational parameters flow rates, material properties, and rotational speeds highlights critical factors influencing vibration levels. This sensitivity emphasizes the need for meticulous optimization to mitigate vibrations and enhance operational efficiency. Acknowledging the strengths and limitations of both methodologies becomes imperative. Simulations excel in predictive accuracy and controlled analyses but might oversimplify, while experiments provide validation and realism but are resource-intensive and prone to measurement uncertainties. The validated simulation model serves as a potent tool for engineering design and optimization. Understanding the impact of operational parameters on vibrations guides tailored designs and operational adjustments to maximize pump efficiency and reliability. Leveraging the

simulation's predictive capabilities enables proactive maintenance strategies, minimizing downtime, preventing potential failures, and ensuring operational safety in industrial settings reliant on pump systems. The amalgamation of simulated predictions and empirical measurements in open impeller centrifugal pump vibration analysis yields a profound understanding of the system's behavior. The validated simulation model, complemented by empirical validation, stands as a robust platform for engineering innovation, predictive maintenance strategies, and informed decision-making. The research's significance transcends its specific focus, extending to broader applications in various industries reliant on pump systems. By embracing the strengths and addressing the limitations of both methodologies, this research paves the way for advancements in pump technology, operational efficiency, and safety protocols, ultimately contributing to a more sustainable and optimized industrial landscape.

REFERENCES

- Al-Khazali, H. A. H., & Askari, M. R. (2012). The experimental analysis of vibration monitoring in system rotor dynamic with validate results using simulation data. *International Scholarly Research Notices*, 2012.
- Al-Obaidi, A. (2018). *Experimental and numerical investigations on the cavitation phenomenon in a centrifugal pump*. University of Huddersfield.
- Albraik, A., Althobiani, F., Gu, F., & Ball, A. (2012). Diagnosis of centrifugal pump faults using vibration methods. *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, 364(1), 12139.
- Ali, A., Si, Q., Wang, B., Yuan, J., Wang, P., Rasool, G., Shokriani, A., Ali, A., & Zaman, M. A. (2022). Comparison of empirical models using experimental results of electrical submersible pump under two-phase flow: Numerical and empirical model validation. *Physica Scripta*, 97(6), 65209.
- Andwari, A. M., Muhamad Said, M. F., Abdul Aziz, A., Esfahanian, V., Zadeh, A. S., Idris, M. A., Mohd Perang, M. R., & Mohd Jamil, H. (2018). Design, modeling and simulation of a high-pressure gasoline direct injection (GDI) pump for small engine applications. *Journal of Mechanical Engineering (JMEchE)*, 1, 107–120.
- Bachmann, H. (1995). *Vibration problems in structures: practical guidelines*. Springer Science & Business Media.
- Bayindir, R., & Cetinceviz, Y. (2011). A water pumping control system with a programmable logic controller (PLC) and industrial wireless modules for industrial plants—An experimental setup. *ISA Transactions*, 50(2), 321–328.
- Braun, O. (2009). *Part load flow in radial centrifugal pumps*. Epfl.
- Cattaneo, P. M., Dalstra, M., & Frich, L. H. (2001). A three-dimensional finite element model from computed tomography data: a semi-automated method. *Proceedings of the Institution of Mechanical Engineers, Part H: Journal of Engineering in Medicine*, 215(2), 203–212.
- Chen, L., Wei, L., Wang, Y., Wang, J., & Li, W. (2022). Monitoring and predictive maintenance of centrifugal pumps based on smart sensors. *Sensors*, 22(6), 2106.
- Cirak, F., Scott, M. J., Antonsson, E. K., Ortiz, M., & Schröder, P. (2002). Integrated modeling, finite-element analysis, and engineering design for thin-shell structures using subdivision. *Computer-Aided Design*, 34(2), 137–148.
- Fjeld, Ø. M. (2015). *Simulation of the natural frequencies in a pump-turbine runner in air and water*. NTNU.
- Heikkilä, T. (2022). *Integration of online vibration measurement system to operator level*.
- Hundshagen, M., Mansour, M., Thévenin, D., & Skoda, R. (2019). Numerical investigation of two-phase air-water flow in a centrifugal pump with closed or semi-open impeller. *Proceedings of the 13th European Turbomachinery Conference on Turbomachinery Fluid Dynamics and Thermodynamics, Paper ID: ETC2019-011*.
- Jami, A. (2016). *Impeller fault detection under fluctuating flow conditions using artificial neural networks*. University of Pretoria.
- Matta, L. M., & Szasz, G. (2018). Vibration and fatigue failures at pipeline facilities. *International Pipeline Conference*, 51869, V001T03A036.
- Mohanta, R. K., Chelliah, T. R., Allamsetty, S., Akula, A., & Ghosh, R. (2017). Sources of vibration and their treatment in hydro power stations-A review. *Engineering Science and Technology, an International Journal*, 20(2), 637–648.
- Mousmoulis, G., Karlsen-Davies, N., Aggidis, G., Anagnostopoulos, I., & Papanonis, D. (2019). Experimental analysis of cavitation in a centrifugal pump using acoustic emission, vibration measurements and flow visualization. *European Journal of Mechanics-B/Fluids*, 75, 300–311.
- Mustata, S. C., Dracea, D., Tronac, A. S., Sarbu, N., & Constantin, E. (2015). Diagnosis and vibration diminishing in pump operation. *Procedia Engineering*, 100, 970–976.
- Panda, A. K., Rapur, J. S., & Tiwari, R. (2018). Prediction of flow blockages and impending cavitation in

- centrifugal pumps using Support Vector Machine (SVM) algorithms based on vibration measurements. *Measurement*, 130, 44–56.
- Posa, A. (2016). *Vibration behavior of a centrifugal pump with integrated permanent magnet motor*.
- Volk, M. (2013). *Pump characteristics and applications*. CRC Press.
- Wang, C., Shi, W., Si, Q., & Zhou, L. (2014). Numerical calculation and finite element calculation on impeller of stainless steel multistage centrifugal pump. *Journal of Vibroengineering*, 16(4), 1723–1734.
- Whelan, M. J., Gangone, M. V, Janoyan, K. D., & Jha, R. (2009). Real-time wireless vibration monitoring for operational modal analysis of an integral abutment highway bridge. *Engineering Structures*, 31(10), 2224–2235.
- Wilson, K. C., Addie, G. R., Sellgren, A., & Clift, R. (2006). *Slurry transport using centrifugal pumps*. Springer Science & Business Media.
- Woo, S., & Vacca, A. (2022). An investigation of the vibration modes of an external gear pump through experiments and numerical modeling. *Energies*, 15(3), 796.